

COLLINSON, DAEHNKE, INLOW & GRECO
Laura E. Inlow, Esq., State Bar No. 130584
Email: laura.inlow@cdiglaw.com
21515 Hawthorne Blvd., Suite 800
Torrance, CA 90503
Telephone: (424) 212-7777
Facsimile: (424) 212-7757

Attorneys for Defendant, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

MARYAM MNASAKANYAN,
GURGEN HARUTYUNYAN,
INDIVIDUALLY AND AS
SUCCESSORS IN INTEREST TO
THE ESTATE OF ALBERT
HARUTYUNYAN AKA ALBERD
TERSARGYAN,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CHARLES L. BECK, DAN MYERS,
AMY ASHVANIAN, JIM
MCDONNELL, DR. MARVIN
SOUTHARD, DR. STEPHEN SHEA,
DR. PHUONG TRUONG, JACKIE
LACEY, JONATHAN CHUNG, CITY
OF LOS ANGELES, LOS ANGELES
COUNTY and DOES 1-10, Inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO. 18-CV-10376 DDP (JCx)

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

**[CHANGE MADE BY COURT TO
PARAGRAPHS 1A, 3, 6.2, 6.3, 8(c),
9(c), 11, 12.3, Exhibit A]**

FAC Filed: March 21, 2019

///

///

1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal. Rather, when the parties seek permission from the court to file material under seal, the parties must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and with any pertinent orders of the assigned District Judge and Magistrate Judge.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

Good cause exists for entry of this order. As Plaintiff is seeking and Defendants may produce, among other things, third party private and confidential information; portions of the personnel files of the deputy personnel involved in the subject incident, which contains confidential information, and information the County of Los Angeles regards as official information; performance evaluations, work schedules/logs and rosters, and training records for the involved deputy personnel; administrative investigation files, internal policies and procedures for the Sheriff's Department and Department of Mental Health, which contain sensitive materials which the County of Los Angeles believes need special protection from public disclosure.

The documents identified in this Protective Order, which Defendants believe in good faith constitute or embody confidential information which the County of Los Angeles maintains as strictly confidential and are otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law, are therefore entitled to heightened protection from disclosure. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes

over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: This pending state lawsuit.

2.2 Challenging Party: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under administrative, state or federal statute or by law, and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: A Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, board, departments, divisions, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staff).

2.12 Producing Party: A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.

2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

2.15 Receiving Party: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any deposition testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material, other than during a court hearing or at trial.

Any use of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial shall be governed by the orders of the presiding judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial.

4. DURATION

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations.

Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

1 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

2 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
3 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing
4 Party affix at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL
5 legend”), to each page that contains protected material. The legend must not obstruct a Party’s
6 ability to view the contents of that document. If only a portion or portions of the material on a
7 page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
8 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

9 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not
10 designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it
11 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the
12 material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting
13 Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must
14 determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,
15 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
16 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or
17 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
18 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

19 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the
20 Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected
21 testimony.

22 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other
23 tangible items, that, at a minimum, the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior
24 of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.”
25 If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the
26 extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

27 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
28 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s

1 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a
2 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is
3 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

4 5.4 Privilege Logs. If a party withholds information that is responsive to a discovery
5 request by claiming that it is privileged or otherwise protected from discovery, that party shall
6 promptly prepare and provide a privilege log that is sufficiently detailed and informative for the
7 opposing party to assess whether a document's designation as privileged is justified. See
8 Fed.R.Civ.P. 26(b)(5). The privilege log shall set forth the privilege relied upon and specify
9 separately for each document or for each category of similarly situated documents:

- 10 (a) the title and description of the document, including number of pages or Bates-
11 number range;
- 12 (b) the subject matter addressed in the document;
- 13 (c) the identity and position of its author(s);
- 14 (d) the identity and position of all addressees and recipients;
- 15 (e) the date the document was prepared and, if different, the date(s) on which it was
16 sent to or shared with persons other than its author(s); and
- 17 (f) the specific basis for the claim that the document is privileged and protected.

18 Communications involving counsel that post-date the filing of the complaint need not be
19 placed on a privilege log

20 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

21 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
22 confidentiality upon designation of a document(s) as Confidential by the Designating Party
23 provided the challenge is made within the applicable discovery deadline.

24 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution
25 process under Local Rules 37-1, et seq.

26 6.3 Failing informal resolution between parties, the Designating Party may file and
27 serve a Motion for a Protective Order with the Court consistent with the District Judge's
28 Scheduling Order and pursuant to Local Rules 37-1, et seq. The parties agree that if the Motion

for Protective Order is filed within 21 days of the written challenge (subject to extension upon agreement of the Parties), the Material will retain its original designation until the Court rules on the Motion for a Protective Order. If the Designating Party does not file a motion within the 21-day period following a challenge, the material is no longer designated as CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION for purposes of this Stipulation, but that change in designation does not bar the Producing Party from subsequently filing a motion for a protective order consistent with the District Judge's Scheduling Order and pursuant to Local Rules 37-1, et seq.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

(a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

(b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

(c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(d) the court and its personnel;

- 1 (e) court reporters and their staff;
- 2 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom
- 3 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
- 4 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);
- 5 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
- 6 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;
- 7 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to
- 8 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the
- 9 witness sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” form attached as Exhibit A
- 10 hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign
- 11 the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the
- 12 Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits
- 13 to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and
- 14 may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- 15 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually
- 16 agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

17 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER

18 LITIGATION

19 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels

20 disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that

21 Party must:

22 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a

23 copy of the subpoena or court order;

24 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issues in

25 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to

26 this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order;

27 and

28

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission, or unless otherwise required by the law or court order. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

1 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party,
2 if requested.

3 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
4 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce
5 the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party
6 timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its
7 possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a
8 determination by the court, unless otherwise required by the law or court order. Absent a court
9 order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in
10 this court of its Protected Material.

11 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL.

12 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected
13 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective
14 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the
15 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the
16 Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were
17 made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the
18 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

19 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED
20 MATERIAL.

21 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced
22 material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the parties agree that the
23 obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure
24 26(b)(5)(B) as a guideline for this state action. This provision is not intended to modify whatever
25 procedure may be established in any discovery order that provides for production without prior
26 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rules of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties
27 reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the
28

1 attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement
2 in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

3 12. MISCELLANEOUS

4 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to
5 seek its modification by the Court in the future.

6 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective
7 Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any
8 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly,
9 no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material
10 covered by this Protective Order.

11 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected
12 Material must comply with the Civil Local Rule 79-5 and with any pertinent orders of the
13 assigned District Judge and Magistrate Judge. Protected Material may only be filed under seal
14 pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a
15 Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving
16 Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

17 13. FINAL DISPOSITION.

18 After the final disposition of this Action (as defined in paragraph 4), within 60 days of a
19 written request by the Designating Party, or another period of time agreed upon by the parties,
20 each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such
21 material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts,
22 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
23 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must
24 submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the
25 Designating Party) by the 60 day or agreed upon deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where
26 appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the
27 Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other
28 format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision,

Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED: January 3, 2020

/s/

Tracey Grayson, Esq.
Attorneys for Plaintiffs
MARYAM MNASAKANYAN and GURGEN
HARUTYUNYAN

DATED: January 31, 2019

COLLINSON, DAEHNKE, INLOW & GRECO

/s/

LAURA E. INLOW
LENORE C. KELLY
Attorneys for Defendants,
COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

DATED: January 31, 2019

/s/

SUREKHA A. SHEPHERD,
Attorneys for Defendants,
CITY OF LOS ANGELES

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED AS MODIFIED.

Dated: February 10, 2020

/s/

Honorable Jacqueline Chooljian
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

EXHIBIT A
ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
_____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I
have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by
the United States District Court for the Central District of California on February 10,
2020 in the case of *Maryam Mnasakanyan et al. v. Charles L. Beck, et al.*, Case No. 2:18-
cv-10376. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated
Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could
expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise
that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this
Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the
provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for
the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated
Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this
action.

I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
_____ [print or type full address and telephone
number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or
any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____